



©This presentation is the property of the Structural Engineers Association of New York (SEAoNY) and shall not be reused or copied without the expressed, written consent of SEAoNY. All rights are reserved therein including copyright.

#### Presenters:

Joseph F. Tortorella, Vice President of Robert Silman Associates, Structural Engineers; President Elect of the Structural Engineers Association of New York (SEAoNY)

Over 26 years experience in N.Y. City
Firm has consulted on over 10,500 projects
Firm specializes in Historic Preservation as well as new construction
Chair of the SEAoNY committee on the Improvement of Underpinning Practices



#### Presenters:

George J. Tamaro, Partner at Mueser Rutledge Consulting Engineers (Geotechnical and Structural Engineers)

Over 46 years experience in N.Y. City
Firm has consulted on over 10,000 projects
Firm specializes in the design and construction inspection of foundation and marine structures
Member of SEAoNY



# Why is SEAoNY here?





# **Public Safety**





# Lawsuits and costly repairs







# Facts and Figures:

•Improper Underpinning procedures results in more frequent failures/ costly lawsuits then any other construction failure event

•1 to2 Failures per month in N.Y. City and surrounding boroughs

•Most of the failures are occurring in Brooklyn, typically on small sites/small projects, 1 to 6 stories.



•EVERYONE involved in the process needs to be educated about the inherent problems



When is underpinning required in N.Y. City and the boroughs?

• "Where support of adjacent structures is required" (NYCBC)



# Why is underpinning required in N.Y. City and the boroughs?

#### To prevent damage to adjacent structures





How is underpinning provided in N.Y. City and the boroughs?

- Underpinning piers
- Sheeting and bracing
- Cofferdams
- On hard rock in lieu of underpinning
- Other means acceptable to the Commissioner



# Who is responsible to provide underpinning required in N.Y. City and the boroughs?

• The developer of the new structure, unless prevented from doing so by the owner of the affected structure, then the owner of the affected structure is responsible to protect his structure



What can be done to improve the practice of underpinning in N.Y. City and the boroughs?

- Prior to design
- During Design
- **III.** During Construction



### Prior to design

When should the engineer become involved in the process?

After the owner has purchased a site?

After the owner interviews architects?

After the first architect is released because he expressed his/her concern for the feasibility of doing the project due to underpinning issues?

NO...NO...NO!!!



# Involve the engineers early on





The structural engineer and geotechnical engineer should be brought on board as early in the process as possible...even if on an advisory role.

The engineers can evaluate the site using their knowledge of the location to advise the owner even before purchasing a property, of the potential for problems.

Once it is established to continue....the selection of the consultants is completed and the design begins....



## Structural engineers role:

#### **Due Diligence**

The engineer of record should make all efforts to evaluate the adjoining site conditions for the following:

I. Adjacent foundation construction type and projections

- Adjacent building construction type
- Historical significance of adjoining properties



# Geotechnical engineers role:

- Site investigation, borings and test pits
- Review existing information on area
- Perform site reconnaissance
- Perform adequate number of borings
- Perform test pits to determine/verify foundations for adjacent structures
- Make recommendations for foundations for new structure and protection of adjacent structures.
- Make recommendations for monitoring adjacent structures



Why are borings important to the protection of adjacent structures?

Because they help identify:

- Soils supporting adjacent structures
- Soils susceptible to settlement from vibrations
- Existing ground water conditions
- "Running sand" conditions



Why are test pits important to the protection of adjacent structures?

Because they help identify:

- Condition of foundations of adjacent structures
- Depth of foundations of adjacent structures



# How does soil conditions and/or groundwater impact the underpinning design?

- Weak and sensitive soils and a high ground water table can make pit underpinning difficult to execute safely
- Underpinning may be necessary even if new foundation is above level of existing foundations if soils are susceptible to consolidation or vibration settlement
- Dewatering may cause consolidation of soils and/or exposure of existing piling to deterioration



How can an excavation of overburden on our site, affect a neighboring site?

Sequence is important, put in the sheeting before you excavate!



# How can vibrations on our site, affect a neighboring site?

Even if you do not go below the adjacent foundation pile driving vibrations can cause the building to settle and tilt!





# Available underpinning methods:

- Pit underpinning
- Jack piles
- Bracket piles
- Micro piles
- Ground improvement
- Rigid excavation support walls



# Typical approach pit for pit underpinning





# Arching of wall over approach pit





# Concreting and preloading of the underpinning pier





# Temporary support of concentrated load (colur









Staging is important





# Jack pile installation



PILE GROUP READY FOR CONCRETING



MEASURING MOVEMENT OF INDIVIDUAL PILE







Bracket pile installation

Preloading with steel wedges

# Micro pile installation











Ground improvement Jet grout underpinning





Rigid excavation support walls (slurry walls) can eliminate direct underpinning of structure

# Support of rock face in lieu of underpinning





# II. During Design:

What is the structural engineers role?What level of information should be shown on the structural engineers drawings?"Means and Methods of Construction"What is the Geotechnical engineers role?



What is the structural engineers role? Due Diligence Provide an underpinning detail that is applicable to the specific project Make sure contractor understands the site and complications of underpinning Stay involved when construction starts



# Due Diligence

Understand the site conditions Understand the adjoining buildings Inform the contractor and his engineer of all issues uncovered prior to design Educate the owner



# Provide an adequate level of information on the design documents

The engineer of record (EOR) should provide detailed information on his/her drawings that relates specifically to the site under consideration. Is this enough information???



#### "God is in the details." Ludwig Mies van der Rohe (not in this case!!)





#### What's wrong with this picture???







#### EXISTING WALL UNDERPINNING SEQUENCE:

- STARTING NTH SEGMENTS (A) ORLY, DIG PITS 4-O' NOTE, HAXIMA SMALTAREOULY PLACING REQUIRED SEETING AND BRACING, ALL PITS TO BE SHEETED ON ALL PORE SIDES, PACK VOIDS BETTERED SHEETING AND SOL WITH SOL COMMIT. BEAVE A MINIMAN OF 12-O' OF EXISTING SOL BETHEEN PITS).
- GLEAN BOTTOM OF EXISTING FOOTING AND RECOMPLACT DISTURBED SOLLAT BOTTOM OF ITT WITH MECHANICAL PAN TAMPERS, COMPLACT TO HIS OF THE MAXIMM DEN OF THE SOLL LOSS OF GREAK SHOLLD BE KETT TO A HINKING HIS BACKFLING THE SOLLARS WHERE AND HIGH ROSSIELS WITH GREAT PARTED INTO THE VIOLS
- 3. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL INSTALL ADEQUATE LATERAL-BRACING SYSTEM(5) TO PREVENT MOVEMENT IN THE EXISTING STRUCTURE(5) AND IN THE NEW INDERPINING
- 5. FOR SEGMENTS (3) DIG PITS 4"-O", MAXIMUM, WIDE WITH REQUIRED SHEETING & BRACING
- 6. FOR SEGMENTS (B) REPEAT CONCRETING, GLEANING, COMPACTION, STEEL, HEDGES AND DRYPACKING AS DESCRIBED IN NOTES 2, 3 AND 4.
- 1. FOR SEGMENTS (C) DIG PITS 4'-O', MAXIMUM, MIDE WITH REQUIRED SHEETING & BRACING
- 5. FOR SEGMENTS (C) REPEAT CONCRETING, CLEANING, COMPACTION, STEEL HEDGES AND DRYPACKING AS DESCRIBED IN NOTES 2, 3 AND 4.
- 4. FOR SEGMENTS (), DIG OUT SOLL DETINEN COMPLETED SEGMENTS () AND () PROVIDE SHEETING AND BRACING AS RECAIRED.
- ID. FOR SEGMENTS (D) REPEAT CONCRETING, CLEANING, COMPACTION, STEEL NEDGES AND DRYPACKING AS DESCRIBED IN NOTES 2, 3 AND 4.
- WERE BOTTOM OF ADJACENT UNDERPINING PITS ARE AT DIFFERENT ELEVATIONS, THE DEEPER PIT SHALL BE INSTALLED FIRST.
- 12 UNDERFINING FITS CLOSER THAN 12' APART SHALL NOT BE EXCAVATED AT THE SAME THE.



#### SECTION OF MOOD SHEETING/BRACING

#### TYPICAL UNDERPINNING DETAILS

#### UNDERPINNING NOTES

- CONTINUES LOTTEL
   SUBCEPTINIES LOTTEL TRUE CONTINUES AND ADDITIONAL INCERTINIES
   REGEMENTS PATULATES
   REGEMENTS PATULATES
   REGEMENTS DELATES ADDITIONAL INCERTINIES
   REGEMENTS DELATES ADDITIONAL INCERCINIES
   REGEMENTS DELATES ADDITION
- 1 4





### Provide enough information to the contractor

# What is "Means and Methods of Construction"?

This is a term used by the AIA to describe construction procedures that are the responsibility of the contractor. That does not mean that the design professional should avoid the underpinning process.



#### What is the Geotechnical Engineers Role?

- Incorporate requirements of specific site so that contractors engineer can be better educated!
- Indicate how load should be transferred; how pits should be sheeted and or braced; the soil conditions (refer to the geotechnical report!)
- Specify the appropriate type of underpinning to the site conditions.



# **III. During Construction**

# What are the key breakdowns that often lead to failures?



#### Excavation begins on site without proper supervision or notification. Before long, undermining occurs or too much overburden is removed.





# Over excavation with disregard for adjoining properties





#### Complete excavation with inadequate underpinning and bracing in place





# What can be done to avoid these problems?

Contractors must be more aware of the ramifications of sending an excavator on site to do a general excavation. Submit "mass excavation plan"

The contractor MUST hire his own engineer to design and detail the required underpinning.

The controlled inspector must be retained BEFORE construction starts and actively involved in the planning process.



### **Preconstruction surveys**

A thorough preconstruction survey of all adjacent properties is imperative. Cracks which were pre-existing will become the contractors and owners responsibility if they are not documented. Every tenant will claim damages that were pre-existing!! Access can be difficult but that should not mean we should not try. SEAoNY's recommendation to the DOB is to make this mandatory and if not allowed, the adjacent owner waives the right to sue.





An active and positive relationship with neighboring property owners can alleviate many of the inherent adversarial problems associated with underpinning.

Monitoring of site should be done using surveyors, crack monitors, vibration monitors.

The design team should be consulted for knowledge about the site. A working relationship is beneficial.

Proper and complete shop drawings and calculations should be submitted for review prior to any work commencing.



# How can the project's structural engineer play a role during construction?

- Review the contractor's engineers submission for how it applies to the specific site and site conditions.
- Make sure the contractor has the proper experience in underpinning buildings of similar construction and site conditions.
- Remain an active participant. Encourage a dialogue with neighbors.



Take advantage of the early Due Diligence!

# How can the project's geotechnical engineer play a role during construction?

Have the Geotechnical engineer review the contractor's underpinning design and construction sequence and then verify that the design is being followed in the field

- Consult the Geotechnical engineer during the course of construction, especially if conditions found in the field do not conform with those expected
- Have the Geotechnical engineer review monitoring data



What steps can be included in the design of the underpinning to improve the results?



## Steel shims for load transfer





## Sheeting and Bracing

All pits, unless otherwise dictated by geotechnical engineer, should be sheeted excavations.

Deep pits must be laterally braced and reinforced as required.

Corner excavations should return under the adjacent building on a slope and be sheeted.



## Monitoring

Vibration monitors should be used where historic structures are present (required by code)

Surveyor should be retained to monitor settlement. Settlement predictions can be made by geotechnical engineer. This can help prevent problems getting out of control.

Crack monitors can be installed to measure all existing cracks.



# **Controlled Inspections**

N.Y. City requires controlled inspections for underpinning.

§ 27-724(C26-1112.6) Construction required for or affecting the support of adjacent properties or buildings. Except in cases where a proposed excavation will extend less than ten feet below the legally established grade, all underpinning operations and the construction and excavation of temporary or permanent cofferdams, caissons, braced excavated surfaces, or other constructions or excavations required for or affecting the support of adjacent properties or buildings shall be subject to controlled inspection. The details of underpinning, cofferdams, caissons, bracing, or other constructions required for the support of adjacent properties or buildings shall be subject to shown on the plans or prepared in the form of shop or detail drawings and shall be approved by the architect or engineer who prepared the plans.



### Communication is key!!

Involve the inspector early on in the projects construction to insure that they are on board with what is proposed and are aware of sequencing, start dates and all details of underpinning. Inform them of site conditions Provide the geotechnical report for reference

Make sure the design team knows that construction has commenced



What can a homeowner who wants to underpin his neighbors house do if he cannot afford experts and all of the recommendations we make?

Assuming that cost prohibits this extensive evaluation, a series of standards for certain site types could be developed.

If underpinning is necessary, an engineer and/or suitable contractor must be retained.

Underpinning contractors could be licensed, further protecting the public.

Inspectors for the DOB could be educated on what to look for.



Can he afford "not" do this??

#### Thank you!

Questions and answers/panel discussion

Panelists include:

John S. Deerkoski, P.E. FASCE, President, John S. Deerkoski, P.E. and Associates

Robert LiMandri, Deputy Commissioner, Operations, NYC DOB

Dan Eschenasy, P.E., Deputy Asst. Commissioner, Safety and Emergency Operations, NYC DOB

